

Pierre Strosser

## **Analyzing Alternative Policy Instruments for the Irrigation Sector**

An Assessment of the Potential for Water Market Development in the Chishtian Sub-division, Pakistan



Proefschrift  
ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor  
op gezag van de rector magnificus  
van de Landbouwniversiteit Wageningen  
dr. C.M. Karssen,  
in het openbaar te verdedigen  
op woensdag 17 december 1997  
des namiddags te vier uur in de Aula

# Contents

Abstract v

Contents vi

Abbreviations and glossary of local terms ix

- 1 Introduction 1**
  - 1.1 Water scarcity and water sector policies 1
  - 1.2 Main issues related to irrigation system management in Pakistan 7
  - 1.3 The historical context to understand current policy changes in Pakistan 9
  - 1.4 Proposed options for irrigation sector policy in Pakistan 13
  - 1.5 Justification of the study 14
  - 1.6 Objectives of the study 15
  
- 2 Understanding water markets: a literature review 17**
  - 2.1 Water markets from a economic theory perspective 17
  - 2.2 A large diversity in existing water markets 21
  - 2.3 Existing water markets: a diversity of situations for a single objective? 25
  - 2.4 Conclusion of the literature review on water markets 29
  
- 3 An integrated approach to assess the potential for water markets development in the irrigation sector 30**
  - 3.1 Main elements of the integrated approach 30
  - 3.2 Representation of an irrigation system in Pakistan 33
  - 3.3 Main biophysical and decisional process for analyzing water markets in Pakistan 37
    - 3.3.1 Analysis of *existing* water markets 37
    - 3.3.2 *Potential* for water market development 41
  - 3.4 Selected research issues related to the analysis of existing and potential surface and groundwater markets in Pakistan 43
  - 3.5 Operationalization of the integrated approach 48
    - 3.5.1 Development of simulation and optimization models 48
    - 3.5.2 Time and spatial scale issues 48
    - 3.5.3 Spatial heterogeneity 51
    - 3.5.4 Linking simulation models to assess the impact of water market scenarios 52
  - 3.6 Development of a performance matrix for evaluating water market scenario 53
  - 3.7 Summary: operationalizing the integrated approach for the analysis of water markets in Pakistan 54

- 4 **Description of the Chishtian Sub-division, South-Punjab, Pakistan 56**
  - 4.1 Irrigation system and hydraulic network 56
  - 4.2 Physical environment 58
  - 4.3 Farming systems and socio-economic features of the Chishtian Sub-Division 60
  - 4.4 Sample selection and collection of information 64
  - 4.5 Summary 66
  
- 5 **Development of farm and watercourse stochastic linear programming models 68**
  - 5.1 Methodology 68
  - 5.2 Analyzing the diversity of farming systems and building the farm typology 70
  - 5.3 Theoretical consideration on micro-economic linear programming models 77
    - 5.3.1 General issues related to farm decisions and agricultural production 77
    - 5.3.2 Theoretical considerations on linear programming and risk 78
    - 5.3.3 General form of a stochastic linear programming model 80
  - 5.4 Development of stochastic linear programming models for farms in the Chishtian Sub-division 83
  - 5.5 Calibration and validation of the farm and watercourse stochastic linear programming models 92
  - 5.6 Classifying Fordwah and Azim watercourses to identify their socio-economic profiles and watercourse models 97
  - 5.7 Summary 100
  
- 6 **Current water markets in the Chishtian Sub-division: functioning, organization and impact on agricultural production 102**
  - 6.1 Functioning of water markets in eight sample watercourses of the Chishtian Sub-division 102
    - 6.1.1 Description of existing water markets 102
    - 6.1.2 Who participates in water transactions? 109
    - 6.1.3 Contracts and water prices 115
    - 6.1.4 Looking at examples of intensive canal water markets in the Chishtian Sub-division 117
    - 6.1.5 Summary 119
  - 6.2 Impact of water transactions on irrigation water supply 120
  - 6.3 Use of stochastic linear programming and physical models to investigate the functioning and impact of existing water markets 126
    - 6.3.1 Analyzing supply and demand curves for tubewell water 126
    - 6.3.2 Estimating the impact of water market scenarios on agricultural production using the stochastic linear programming watercourse models 130
    - 6.3.3 Impact of water markets on the environment using the water balance model, the SWAP93 model and the sodicity equation 135
  - 6.4 Summary and discussion 137

<b>7</b>	<b>Scenarios for potential canal water market development in the Chishtian Sub-division</b>	<b>140</b>
7.1	Background	140
7.2	Defining potential water market scenarios	141
7.3	Technical issues related to the development of water markets in the Chishtian Sub-division	146
7.4	Analyzing the potential for canal water market development between sample watercourses of the Fordwah and Azim distributaries	152
7.5	Analyzing the potential for canal water market development between the Fordwah and Azim distributaries	162
7.6	Summary and discussion: what future for water market development in Pakistan?	165
<b>8</b>	<b>Integrated approach: lessons from implementation and perspectives</b>	<b>173</b>
8.1	Using the integrated approach for the analysis of water markets in Pakistan	173
8.2	Future of the integrated approach in the Chishtian Sub-division	175
8.3	General perspectives on the integrated approach	177
<b>9</b>	<b>Summary and conclusions</b>	<b>178</b>
9.1	Potential for water market development in irrigation systems in Pakistan: do we have more answers?	178
9.2	General application of the developed integrated approach to irrigation management	182
	References	185
	Appendices	198
	Samenvatting	229
	Résumé	236
	About the author	243



International Irrigation  
Management Institute  
Pakistan National Program  
12 Km Multan Road,  
Chowk Thokar Niaz Baig  
Lahore 53700  
Pakistan



Cemagref  
Groupement de Montpellier,  
Division Irrigation  
361, rue J.F. Breton, BP 5095  
34033 Montpellier cedex 1  
France



Wageningen Agricultural  
University  
Department of Water Resources  
Nieuwe Kanaal 11  
6709 PA Wageningen  
The Netherlands